

CARMEL HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION

CAUCUS ROOM, CARMEL CITY HALL

1 CIVIC SQUARE, CARMEL, IN

May 11, 2023 – 6:00 P.M.

Minutes

1. Call to Order

Nick Davis called the meeting to order at 6:10 P.M.

2. Roll Call

Commissioners Present: Nick Davis, Fred Swift, Rosemary Dunkle, Nick Kestner,

+ one vacancy

Commissioners Not Present: Jess Lawhead, Bill Sanders

Staff: Mark Dollase, Alex Brooks

Guests: Jim Shinaver, Amy Forbush, Carl Chapman, Kay Chapman

3. Approval of Minutes (4/13/2023)

Fred motioned to approve the April minutes. Rosemary seconded. Motion approved 4-0.

4. Hearing of Visitors

None

5. Certificate of Appropriateness Review

None

6. Report on Staff Approvals

None

7. Financial Report

a. Budget update

Alex said the budget is \$84,402.25.

8. Old Business

a. Update on Designation of Caperton House Historic District

Mark said Landmarks staff are continuing to work on the Preservation Plan for the home.

9. New Business

a. Demolition Delay Application—241 1st Ave NW (garage only)

Jim Shinaver presented the request for the Chapmans, who are renovating their home at 241 1st Ave NW. They felt they needed to demolish their garage in order to fulfill their vision for their home's remodel. Jim said the Chapmans sought to increase the size of their home due to the increased size of their family with their grandchildren. Mark gave a summary of his report and noted that the garage appeared to have no structural issues. In addition, Mark noted the presence of the sign indicating the garage was available to be moved. Mark also said the staff gave approval for allowing the demolition of the garage to proceed. He expressed his opinion that the proposed addition was larger than ideal for a home of this size. Rosemary moved to accept staff recommendation; Fred seconded. Fred also expressed agreement with Mark's opinion on the proposed addition. In addition, Fred said he hoped the addition would not overpower the existing home's structure. Motion passed 4-0.

b. Spring Façade Grant Applications

1215 E 106th St. - Lisa Pratt/Dan Brinkman

Mark and Alex expressed their preference to have a singular pane of glass in garage balcony windows and not fake muntins between the windows. Mark also asked the commission if they had an issue with someone doing the work on their own. The commissioners said they do not have a major issue with that. Alex also mentioned that they could perhaps ask such people to have at least one outside quote.

Staff ranked the project 39/60 and recommended a grant of up to \$3,726.56.

20 Wilson Dr. - Carsen Oden

Mark confirmed that Mr. Oden lives in this home and rents the other two he is submitting for grant funding. Commissioners noted the high price of the proposed garage door.

Staff ranked the project 31/60 and recommended a grant of up to \$4,073.09.

145 Lantern Ln - Carsen Oden

Staff ranked the project 28/60 and recommended a grant of \$0.

623 Emerson Rd. - Carsen Oden

Staff ranked the project 31/60 and recommended a grant of \$0.

105 1st Ave NE - Ginkgo Tree Wellness Center

Nick K. wondered why they would want to paint brick that has already been painted. Fred noted the property's original use as a residence, not a commercial building.

Staff ranked the project 35/60 and recommended a grant of up to \$2,077.50.

24 Thornhurst Dr - Mikim Phan

Rosemary noted there had been partial funding done before for projects.

Staff ranked the project 33/60 and recommended a grant of either \$7,450 or \$0.

9680 Haverstick Rd - Zelma Taylor

Fred and Nick K. expressed concern about whether the proposed lanterns fit the style of the home. Mark wondered if her proposed design might come in black, like the existing lanterns. Rosemary expressed no major issues with the proposal.

Staff ranked the project 45/60 and recommended a grant of up to \$1,515.40.

1201 E 106th St - Philip Ranly

Mark noted the condition would be keeping the existing flooring pattern in any new remodel. Nick D. asked about the decking material and if that would be allowed. Mark agreed that it would be reiterated that this was a porch floor project and not a deck.

Staff ranked the project 46/60 and recommended a grant of up to \$4,500.00.

Fred motioned, seconded by Rosemary to approve the applications for 1201 E 106th St, 9680 Haverstick Rd, 1215 E 106th St, 24 Thornhurst Dr, and 20 Wilson Dr.

Nick K. motioned for \$0 for 20 Wilson Dr. and then proposed a motion to amend the amount to \$2,000. Rosemary seconded.

Fred motioned to amend his previous motion to accommodate this new amount for 20 Wilson Dr. Motion passed 4-0.

Total amount granted was \$19,192.08.

c. Commission Vacancy Update

Mark said he emailed Sharon Kibbe about the Mayor's pick for the Commission vacancy, and she said he has not made a decision yet.

10. Other Business

Nick D. proposed a scholarship for Carmel High students' trip to Washington D.C. for National History Day. He added that the school requested \$500. Fred motioned to approve the \$500. Rosemary mentioned it would take the 15 students \$2,400 just to register, not including travel and lodging. Nick D. said he can verify how much the students still need to raise. Fred amended his motion to give up to \$1,000 and a request that the students present their findings to the Commission. Seconded by Rosemary. Motion passed 4-0.

11. Announcements

12. Adjournment

Rosemary moved to adjourn the meeting. Fred seconded. Motion passed 4-0. Meeting adjourned at 7:26 P.M.



Nick Davis, Chairperson,
Carmel Historic Preservation
Commission



Alex Brooks, Recording Secretary